

**U.S. District Court
Southern District of New York (Foley Square)
CIVIL DOCKET FOR CASE #: 1:17-cv-07572-ALC**

Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University v.
Department of Homeland Security et al
Assigned to: Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr
Cause: 05:552 Freedom of Information Act

Date Filed: 10/04/2017
Jury Demand: None
Nature of Suit: 895 Freedom of
Information Act
Jurisdiction: U.S. Government Defendant

Plaintiff

**Knight First Amendment Institute at
Columbia University**

represented by **Aditya Kamdar**
Durie Tangri LLP
217 Leidesdorff Street
San Francisco, CA 94111
415-362-6666
Email: akamdar@durietangri.com
TERMINATED: 08/29/2019

Caroline Decell
Knight First Amendment Institute At
Columbia University
206 Kent Hall
New York, NY 10027
(212)-854-1607
Email: carrie.decell@knightcolumbia.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Catherine Newby Crump
Samuelson Law Technology & Public
Policy Clinic
U.C. Berkeley School of Law
Berkeley, CA 94720
510-643-4800
Fax: 510-643-4625
Email: ccrump@clinical.law.berkeley.edu
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Leena M. Charlton
Knight First Amendment Institute
475 Riverside Drive
Ste 302
New York, NY 10033
646-745-8508
Email: leena.charlton@knightcolumbia.org
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Megan Kathleen Graham
Samuelson Law, Technology & Public
Policy Clinic At U.C. B
354 Boalt Hall
Berkeley, CA 94720
(510)-664-4381
Email: mgraham@clinical.law.berkeley.edu
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Jameel Jaffer
Knight First Amendment Institute at
Columbia University
475 Riverside Drive, Suite 302
New York, NY 10115
(646)-745-8500

V.

Defendant

U.S. Department of Homeland Security

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
United States Attorney's Office, SDNY
One Saint Andrew's Plaza
New York, NY 10007
(212)637-2743
Fax: (212) 637-2730
Email: Ellen.Blain@usdoj.gov
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement

TERMINATED: 01/16/2018

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

U.S. Department of Justice

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

U.S. Department of State

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

U.S. Customs and Border Protection

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

Defendant

U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement

represented by **Jennifer Ellen Blain**
(See above for address)
LEAD ATTORNEY
ATTORNEY TO BE NOTICED

| Date Filed | # | Docket Text |
|------------|---|--|
| 10/04/2017 | 1 | COMPLAINT against Citizenship and Immigration Services, Customs and Border Protection, Department of Homeland Security, Department of Justice, Department of State, Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Filing Fee \$ 400.00, Receipt Number 0208-14203758) Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Attachments: # 1 Exhibit Exhibit A (FOIA Request))(Jaffer, Jameel) |

| | | |
|------------|----------|---|
| | | (Entered: 10/04/2017) |
| 10/04/2017 | <u>2</u> | CIVIL COVER SHEET filed. (Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 10/04/2017) |
| 10/04/2017 | <u>3</u> | RULE 7.1 CORPORATE DISCLOSURE STATEMENT. No Corporate Parent. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 10/04/2017) |
| 10/04/2017 | <u>4</u> | FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT SUMMONS REQUEST – CAPTION TITLE ERROR REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Customs and Border Protection, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Jaffer, Jameel) Modified on 10/5/2017 (kl). (Entered: 10/04/2017) |
| 10/04/2017 | <u>5</u> | FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT SUMMONS REQUEST – CAPTION TITLE ERROR REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Department of Homeland Security, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Jaffer, Jameel) Modified on 10/5/2017 (kl). (Entered: 10/04/2017) |
| 10/04/2017 | <u>6</u> | FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT SUMMONS REQUEST – CAPTION TITLE ERROR REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Department of Justice, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Jaffer, Jameel) Modified on 10/5/2017 (kl). (Entered: 10/04/2017) |
| 10/04/2017 | <u>7</u> | FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT SUMMONS REQUEST – CAPTION TITLE ERROR REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Department of State, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Jaffer, Jameel) Modified on 10/5/2017 (kl). (Entered: 10/04/2017) |
| 10/04/2017 | <u>8</u> | FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT SUMMONS REQUEST – CAPTION TITLE ERROR REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Jaffer, Jameel) Modified on 10/5/2017 (kl). (Entered: 10/04/2017) |
| 10/04/2017 | <u>9</u> | FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT SUMMONS REQUEST – CAPTION TITLE ERROR REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, re: <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Jaffer, Jameel) Modified on 10/5/2017 (kl). (Entered: 10/04/2017) |
| 10/05/2017 | | CASE OPENING INITIAL ASSIGNMENT NOTICE: The above–entitled action is assigned to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. Please download and review the Individual Practices of the assigned District Judge, located at http://nysd.uscourts.gov/judges/District . Attorneys are responsible for providing courtesy copies to judges where their Individual Practices require such. Please download and review the ECF Rules and Instructions, located at http://nysd.uscourts.gov/ecf_filing.php . (kl) (Entered: 10/05/2017) |
| 10/05/2017 | | Magistrate Judge Katharine H. Parker is so designated. Pursuant to 28 U.S.C. Section 636(c) and Fed. R. Civ. P. 73(b)(1) parties are notified that they may consent to proceed before a United States Magistrate Judge. Parties who wish to consent may access the necessary form at the following link: http://nysd.uscourts.gov/forms.php . (kl) (Entered: 10/05/2017) |
| 10/05/2017 | | Case Designated ECF. (kl) (Entered: 10/05/2017) |
| 10/05/2017 | | ***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS. Notice to Attorney Jameel Jaffer to RE–FILE Document No. <u>9</u> Request for Issuance of Summons, <u>8</u> Request for Issuance of Summons, <u>4</u> Request for Issuance of Summons, <u>7</u> Request for Issuance of Summons, <u>6</u> Request for Issuance of Summons, <u>5</u> Request for Issuance of Summons,. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): PLEASE ENTER ALL PARTIES IN THE CAPTION TITLE THAT ARE VIEWABLE OR ENTER ET AL. Re–file the document using the event type Request for Issuance |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|--|
| | | of Summons found under the event list Service of Process – select the correct filer/filers – and attach the correct summons form PDF. (kl) (Entered: 10/05/2017) |
| 10/05/2017 | <u>10</u> | REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Customs and Border Protection, re: <u>1</u> Complaint., Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 10/05/2017) |
| 10/05/2017 | <u>11</u> | REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Department of Homeland Security, re: <u>1</u> Complaint., Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 10/05/2017) |
| 10/05/2017 | <u>12</u> | REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Department of Justice, re: <u>1</u> Complaint., Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 10/05/2017) |
| 10/05/2017 | <u>13</u> | REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Department of State, re: <u>1</u> Complaint., Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 10/05/2017) |
| 10/05/2017 | <u>14</u> | REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement, re: <u>1</u> Complaint., Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 10/05/2017) |
| 10/05/2017 | <u>15</u> | REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, re: <u>1</u> Complaint., Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 10/05/2017) |
| 10/06/2017 | <u>16</u> | ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to U.S. Customs and Border Protection. (kl) (Entered: 10/06/2017) |
| 10/06/2017 | <u>17</u> | ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to U.S. Department of Homeland Security. (kl) (Entered: 10/06/2017) |
| 10/06/2017 | <u>18</u> | ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to U.S. Department of Justice. (kl) (Entered: 10/06/2017) |
| 10/06/2017 | <u>19</u> | ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to U.S. Department of State. (kl) (Entered: 10/06/2017) |
| 10/06/2017 | <u>20</u> | ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (kl) (Entered: 10/06/2017) |
| 10/06/2017 | <u>21</u> | ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services. (kl) (Entered: 10/06/2017) |
| 10/20/2017 | <u>22</u> | AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE. U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services served on 10/10/2017, answer due 10/31/2017; U.S. Customs and Border Protection served on 10/10/2017, answer due 10/31/2017; U.S. Department of Homeland Security served on 10/10/2017, answer due 10/31/2017; U.S. Department of Justice served on 10/10/2017, answer due 10/31/2017; U.S. Department of State served on 10/10/2017, answer due 10/31/2017; U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement served on 10/10/2017, answer due 10/31/2017. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 10/20/2017) |
| 10/20/2017 | <u>23</u> | AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 10/20/2017) |
| 11/09/2017 | <u>24</u> | AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE. U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services served on 11/6/2017, answer due 11/27/2017; U.S. Customs and Border Protection served on 11/6/2017, answer due 11/27/2017; U.S. Department of Homeland Security served on 11/6/2017, answer due 11/27/2017; U.S. Department of State served on 11/7/2017, answer due 11/28/2017; U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement served on 11/6/2017, answer due 11/27/2017. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Delivery Confirmation)(Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 11/09/2017) |
| 11/13/2017 | <u>25</u> | LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Answer addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated November 13, 2017. Document filed by |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|--|
| | | U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Customs and Border Protection, U.S. Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Department of Justice, U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 11/13/2017) |
| 11/14/2017 | <u>26</u> | ORDER: granting <u>25</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to Answer. The application is granted. U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services answer due 12/28/2017; U.S. Customs and Border Protection answer due 12/28/2017; U.S. Department of Homeland Security answer due 12/28/2017; U.S. Department of Justice answer due 12/28/2017; U.S. Department of State answer due 12/28/2017; U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement answer due 12/28/2017. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 11/14/2017) (ap) (Entered: 11/14/2017) |
| 12/28/2017 | <u>27</u> | ANSWER to <u>1</u> Complaint,. Document filed by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Customs and Border Protection, U.S. Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Department of Justice, U.S. Department of State.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 12/28/2017) |
| 12/28/2017 | <u>28</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated December 28, 2017 re: Immigration and Customs Enforcement Request for Pre-Motion Conference re Motion to Dismiss. Document filed by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 12/28/2017) |
| 01/11/2018 | <u>29</u> | FILING ERROR – ELECTRONIC FILING OF NON-ECF DOCUMENT – STIPULATION OF VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL It is hereby stipulated and agreed by and between the parties and/or their respective counsel(s) that the above-captioned action is voluntarily dismissed, WITHOUT prejudice against the defendant(s) U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement pursuant to Rule 41(a)(1)(A)(ii) of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Jaffer, Jameel) Modified on 1/12/2018 (km). (Entered: 01/11/2018) |
| 01/11/2018 | <u>30</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from Counsel for Plaintiff dated January 11, 2018 re: U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement Request for Pre-Motion Conference re Motion to Dismiss. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 01/11/2018) |
| 01/12/2018 | | ***NOTE TO ATTORNEY TO E-MAIL PDF. Note to Attorney Jameel Jaffer for noncompliance with Section 18.3 of the S.D.N.Y. Electronic Case Filing Rules & Instructions. E-MAIL the PDF for Document <u>29</u> Stipulation of Voluntary Dismissal with handwritten signatures of the attorneys to: judgments@nysd.uscourts.gov. (km) (Entered: 01/12/2018) |
| 01/16/2018 | <u>31</u> | STIPULATION OF VOLUNTARY DISMISSAL OF U.S. IMMIGRATION AND CUSTOMS ENFORCEMENT PURSUANT TO F.R.C.P. 41(a)(1)(A)(ii): IT IS HEREBY STIPULATED AND AGREED by and between the parties' respective counsels that the above-captioned action is voluntarily dismissed, without prejudice, against the defendant U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 41(a)(1)(A)(ii). U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement terminated. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 1/16/2018) (rj) (Entered: 01/16/2018) |
| 02/08/2018 | <u>32</u> | NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Jameel Jaffer on behalf of Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. New Address: Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University, 475 Riverside Drive, Suite 302, New York, NY, USA 10115, 646-745-8500. (Jaffer, Jameel) (Entered: 02/08/2018) |
| 02/12/2018 | <u>33</u> | ORDER: The Court will hold a status conference in this matter on February 23, 2018 at 3:00 p.m. The parties (and/or counsel) should appear in person in Courtroom 1306 at the Thurgood Marshall United States Courthouse, 40 Foley Square, New York, NY, on the date and time specified above. SO ORDERED. Status Conference set for 2/23/2018 at 03:00 PM in Courtroom 1306, 40 Foley Square, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Andrew L. Carter Jr. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 2/12/2018) (rj) (Entered: 02/12/2018) |
| 02/15/2018 | <u>34</u> | NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Catherine Newby Crump on behalf of Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Crump, Catherine) (Entered: |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|---|
| | | 02/15/2018) |
| 02/16/2018 | <u>35</u> | MOTION for Megan Kathleen Graham to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-14712008. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit, # <u>2</u> Exhibit Certificate of Good Standing, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Graham, Megan) (Entered: 02/16/2018) |
| 02/16/2018 | | >>>NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. <u>35</u> MOTION for Megan Kathleen Graham to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number 0208-14712008. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (ma) (Entered: 02/16/2018) |
| 02/20/2018 | <u>36</u> | ORDER FOR ADMISSION PRO HAC VICE granting <u>35</u> Motion for Megan Kathleen Graham to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 2/20/2018) (rj) (Entered: 02/20/2018) |
| 02/20/2018 | <u>37</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from Megan Graham dated 2/20/2018 re: Request to Appear Telephonically at Status Conference. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Graham, Megan) (Entered: 02/20/2018) |
| 02/23/2018 | <u>38</u> | MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>37</u> Letter regarding Request to Appear Telephonically at Status Conference filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 2/21/2018) (rj) (Entered: 02/23/2018) |
| 02/23/2018 | | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr: Status Conference held on 2/23/2018. Jameel Jaffer, Carrie Decell, Alex Abdo, Catherine Crump and Megan Graham for Plaintiff(s). Jennifer Bain for Defendant(s). See Docket No. 39 for complete details. (Court Reporter: Steven Griffing) (tdh) (Entered: 02/26/2018) |
| 02/26/2018 | <u>39</u> | ORDER: As discussed during the February 23, 2018 status conference in this matter, Defendants will complete their searches for responsive documents by March 30, 2018. Defendant U.S. Customs and Border Protection will complete document production by March 30, 2018. The parties shall submit a joint status report by April 9, 2018. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 2/23/2018) (rj) (Entered: 02/26/2018) |
| 03/12/2018 | <u>40</u> | FILING ERROR – DEFICIENT PLEADING – FILED AGAINST PARTY ERROR – AMENDED COMPLAINT amending <u>1</u> Complaint, against U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Customs and Border Protection, U.S. Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Department of Justice, U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. Related document: <u>1</u> Complaint. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A: Letter With Written Consent to File Amended Complaint Pursuant to FRCP 15(a)(2), # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H)(Crump, Catherine) Modified on 3/13/2018 (sj). (Entered: 03/12/2018) |
| 03/12/2018 | <u>41</u> | EXHIBIT TO PLEADING re: <u>40</u> Amended Complaint,,, Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Crump, Catherine) (Entered: 03/12/2018) |
| 03/13/2018 | | ***NOTICE TO ATTORNEY REGARDING DEFICIENT PLEADING. Notice to Attorney Catherine Newby Crump to RE–FILE re: Document No. <u>40</u> Amended Complaint. The filing is deficient for the following reason(s): all of the parties listed on the pleading were not entered on CM ECF; the wrong party/parties whom the pleading is against were selected; (U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement was previously terminated and must be added back to the docket). Docket the event type Add Party to Pleading found under the event list Complaints and Other Initiating Documents.. Re–file the pleading using the event type Amended Complaint found under the event list Complaints and Other Initiating Documents – attach the correct signed PDF – select the individually named filer/filers – select the individually named party/parties the pleading is |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|--|
| | | against. (sj) (Entered: 03/13/2018) |
| 03/14/2018 | <u>42</u> | AMENDED COMPLAINT amending <u>1</u> Complaint, against U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Customs and Border Protection, U.S. Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Department of Justice, U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. Related document: <u>1</u> Complaint,,. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E, # <u>6</u> Exhibit F, # <u>7</u> Exhibit G, # <u>8</u> Exhibit H)(Crump, Catherine) (Entered: 03/14/2018) |
| 03/14/2018 | <u>43</u> | REQUEST FOR ISSUANCE OF SUMMONS as to U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement, re: <u>42</u> Amended Complaint,,. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Crump, Catherine) (Entered: 03/14/2018) |
| 03/15/2018 | <u>44</u> | ELECTRONIC SUMMONS ISSUED as to U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (sj) (Entered: 03/15/2018) |
| 03/15/2018 | <u>45</u> | NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Catherine Newby Crump on behalf of Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. New Address: Samuelson Law, Technology & Public Policy Clinic, U.C. Berkeley School of Law, 433 Boalt Hall (North Addition), Berkeley, CA, United States 94720, 510-642-5049. (Crump, Catherine) (Entered: 03/15/2018) |
| 03/22/2018 | <u>46</u> | AFFIDAVIT OF SERVICE of Summons and Amended Complaint,,. U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement served on 3/19/2018, answer due 4/9/2018. Service was made by Mail. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Delivery Confirmation)(Graham, Megan) (Entered: 03/22/2018) |
| 04/03/2018 | <u>47</u> | ANSWER to <u>42</u> Amended Complaint,,. Document filed by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Customs and Border Protection, U.S. Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Department of Justice, U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D)(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 04/03/2018) |
| 04/09/2018 | <u>48</u> | STATUS REPORT. <i>Joint Status Report</i> Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Crump, Catherine) (Entered: 04/09/2018) |
| 04/13/2018 | <u>49</u> | MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>48</u> Status Report filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. ENDORSEMENT: The proposed briefing schedule is adopted. A status conference is scheduled for May 14, 2018 at 10:00 am. SO ORDERED. Status Conference set for 5/14/2018 at 10:00 AM before Judge Andrew L. Carter Jr. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 4/13/2018) (rj) (Entered: 04/13/2018) |
| 04/13/2018 | <u>50</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated April 13, 2018 re: Joint Status Update re ICE. Document filed by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 04/13/2018) |
| 04/16/2018 | <u>51</u> | MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>50</u> Letter regarding Joint Status Update re ICE filed by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 4/16/2018) (rj) (Entered: 04/16/2018) |
| 04/20/2018 | <u>52</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated April 20, 2018 re: Processing and Production Schedule for State and ICE. Document filed by U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 04/20/2018) |
| 04/20/2018 | <u>53</u> | OATH of Eric F. Stein <i>in Support of State Processing Rates</i> . Document filed by U.S. Department of State. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1)(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 04/20/2018) |
| 04/20/2018 | <u>54</u> | OATH of Catrina Pavlik-Keenan <i>in Support of ICE Production Rates</i> . Document filed by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7, # <u>8</u> Exhibit 8, # <u>9</u> Exhibit 9, # <u>10</u> Exhibit 10)(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 04/20/2018) |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|--|
| 05/04/2018 | <u>55</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from Megan Graham dated May 4, 2018 re: Processing and Production Schedule for State and ICE. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Graham, Megan) (Entered: 05/04/2018) |
| 05/04/2018 | <u>56</u> | OATH of Carrie DeCell in Support of the Knight Institute's Letter [ECF 55]. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Graham, Megan) (Entered: 05/04/2018) |
| 05/14/2018 | <u>57</u> | ORDER: Plaintiff and Defendants U.S. Department of State and U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement shall confer regarding processing and production rates in this case and shall submit a joint status report by May 21, 2018. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 5/14/2018) (anc) (Entered: 05/14/2018) |
| 05/14/2018 | <u>58</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from Carrie DeCell dated 05/14/2018 re: New Information and Proposed DOS Processing Schedule. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 05/14/2018) |
| 05/14/2018 | | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr: Status Conference held on 5/14/2018. Megan Graham and Carrie Decell for Plaintiff(s).Jennifer Bain for Defendant(s). See Docket No. 57. (Court Reporter: Andrew Walker) (tdh) (Entered: 05/24/2018) |
| 05/15/2018 | <u>59</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated May 15, 2018 re: Plaintiffs' Letter Dated May 14, 2018. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/15/2018) |
| 05/15/2018 | <u>60</u> | ORDER: The Court is in receipt of Plaintiff's letter dated May 14, 2018. (ECF No. 58.) Defendant U.S. Department of State shall respond stating its position by May 16, 2018 at 12:00 p.m. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 5/15/2018) (ap) Modified on 5/16/2018 (ap). (Entered: 05/15/2018) |
| 05/18/2018 | <u>61</u> | ORDER: The Court is in receipt of Defendant U.S. Department of State's ("DOS") response to Plaintiff's letter dated May 14, 2018. ECF No. 59. In its letter, DOS stated that it could determine the precise number of responsive pages to Plaintiff's FOIA request by May 17, 2018. Id. DOS is ordered to file a status report providing the number of responsive pages by 3:00 p.m. today. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 5/18/2018) (rj) Modified on 5/18/2018 (rj). (Entered: 05/18/2018) |
| 05/18/2018 | <u>62</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated May 18, 2018 re: State's Number of Pages to Process. Document filed by U.S. Department of State.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/18/2018) |
| 05/18/2018 | <u>63</u> | ORDER: Accordingly, Plaintiff sought production of all such documents by June 15, 2018. Id. DOS filed a response the following day indicating that it could identify the precise number of responsive pages by May 17, 2018. ECF No. 59. Following an Order by this Court, on May 18, 2018 DOS filed a letter stating that 72 documents, totaling 1,719 pages, are most likely responsive to Plaintiff's request. ECF No. 62. DOS reiterated its request for a schedule of 300 pages per month. ECF No. 62. Having considered the respective parties' proposals and the various arguments made, the Court hereby ORDERS Defendant DOS to complete its processing and production of all responsive documents no later than June 28, 2018. Furthermore, DOS should produce those documents that they identify as responsive to Plaintiff's request on a rolling basis. The Court determines that this schedule provides a reasonable time frame for DOS to respond to, Plaintiff's request. SO ORDERED. (Responses due by 6/28/2018) (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 5/18/2018) (rj) (Entered: 05/21/2018) |
| 05/21/2018 | <u>64</u> | STATUS REPORT. Second Joint Status Report Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 05/21/2018) |
| 05/23/2018 | <u>65</u> | ORDER. The Court is in receipt of the parties' joint status report dated May 21, 2018. ECF No. 64. Defendant U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement ("ICE") shall submit a status report advising the Court how many pages of records are responsive to Plaintiff's narrowed request by June 18, 2018 or as soon as ICE completes its responsiveness review, whichever is sooner. Defendant U.S. Department of Justice–Office of Legal Counsel ("DOJ–OLC") shall submit a declaration by May 28, |

| | | |
|------------|---------------------------|--|
| | | 2018 explaining in more detail the bases for its proposed production schedule. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 5/23/2018) (rjm) (Entered: 05/23/2018) |
| 05/29/2018 | <u>66</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated May 29, 2018 re: OLC Production Schedule with Declaration. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit Paul P. Colborn)(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/29/2018) |
| 05/31/2018 | <u>67</u> | ORDER: The Court is in receipt of Defendant U.S. Department of Justice–Office of Legal Counsel ("DOJ–OLC")'s declaration dated May 29, 2018. ECF No. 66. The Court hereby orders DOJ–OLC to complete its processing and production of all responsive documents no later than July 16, 2018. Furthermore, DOJ–OLC should produce those documents that they identify as responsive to Plaintiff's request on a rolling basis. The Court determines that this schedule provides a reasonable time frame for DOJ–OLC to respond to Plaintiff's request. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 5/31/2018) (ne) (Entered: 05/31/2018) |
| 06/18/2018 | <u>68</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated June 18, 2018 re: Status Update on Behalf of ICE. Document filed by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 06/18/2018) |
| 06/22/2018 | <u>69</u> | ORDER: In a joint status report dated May 21, 2018, Defendant United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement ("ICE") proposed to produce records responsive to Plaintiffs Freedom of Information Act ("FOIA") request on a rolling basis, to be completed by December 31, 2018. ECF No. 64. Plaintiff requested a production deadline of August 31, 2018. Id. At that time, ICE did not know how many documents were responsive to Plaintiff's narrowed request. Id. On May 23, 2018, this Court ordered ICE to submit a status report by June 18, 2018 indicating how many pages of records are responsive to Plaintiff's narrowed request. ECF No. 65. On June 18, 2018, ICE wrote to this Court stating that it has determined that 99 pages of documents are most likely responsive to the narrowed request. ECF No. 68. Plaintiff shall file a response by June 25, 2018 indicating its position on a deadline for ICE's production in light of this information. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 6/21/2018) (rj) (Entered: 06/22/2018) |
| 06/22/2018 | <u>70</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from Carrie DeCell dated June 22, 2018 re: ICE's Letter dated June 18, 2018. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 06/22/2018) |
| 06/26/2018 | <u>71</u> | ORDER: The Court hereby ORDERS Defendant U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement ("ICE") to complete its processing and production of all responsive documents no later than July 3, 2018. Furthermore, ICE should produce those documents that they identify as responsive to Plaintiff's request on a rolling basis. SO ORDERED. Responses due by 7/3/2018. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 6/26/2018) (rj) (Entered: 06/26/2018) |
| 07/18/2018 | <u>72</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from Carrie DeCell dated July 18, 2018 re: Request for Clarification of Orders Setting DOS and ICE Production Schedules. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Declaration of Carrie DeCell)(Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 07/18/2018) |
| 07/20/2018 | <u>73</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated July 20, 2018 re: Plaintiff's July 18, 2018 Letter. Document filed by U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/20/2018) |
| 07/24/2018 | <u>74</u> | ORDER: The Court is in receipt of Plaintiff's letter dated July 18, 2018 (ECF No. 72) and Defendants' response dated July 20, 2018 (ECF No. 73). Defendant United States Department of State ("DOS") shall produce all responsive documents by July 31, 2018. Defendant United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement ("ICE") shall make a further submission to this Court stating how many of the referred pages are responsive to Plaintiff's narrowed request and when the review of those pages will be complete by July 25, 2018 at 11:00 a.m. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 7/24/2018) (mro) (Entered: 07/24/2018) |

| | | |
|------------|-----------|--|
| 07/24/2018 | <u>75</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated July 24 2018 re: ICE July 24 Update. Document filed by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/24/2018) |
| 07/26/2018 | <u>76</u> | ORDER: The Court is in receipt of Defendant United States Immigration and Customs Enforcement ("ICE")'s letter dated July 24, 2018 (ECF No. 75). ICE shall submit a status report informing the Court how many documents are responsive to Plaintiff's narrowed request by July 27, 2018. ICE shall also refer any such remaining responsive documents to the relevant agencies no later than July 27, 2018. The Court defers ruling on a production date for any such documents until it receives ICE's status report. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 7/26/2018) (rj) (Entered: 07/26/2018) |
| 07/27/2018 | <u>77</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated July 27, 2018 re: Further ICE Update. Document filed by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/27/2018) |
| 10/05/2018 | <u>78</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from the Knight Institute dated 10/05/2018 re: Status Update. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Graham, Megan) (Entered: 10/05/2018) |
| 11/09/2018 | <u>79</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from Carrie DeCell dated November 9, 2018 re: Request for Pre-Motion Conference re Motion for Partial Summary Judgment. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 11/09/2018) |
| 11/28/2018 | <u>80</u> | MEMO ENDORSEMENT on re: <u>79</u> Letter regarding Request for Pre-Motion Conference re Motion for Partial Summary Judgment, filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 11/28/2018) (rj) (Entered: 11/29/2018) |
| 12/18/2018 | <u>81</u> | NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Caroline Decell on behalf of Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 12/18/2018) |
| 12/27/2018 | <u>82</u> | STANDING ORDER M10-468: The United States Attorney's Office shall notify the Court immediately upon the restoration of Department of Justice funding. (As further set forth in this Order.) (Signed by Judge Colleen McMahon on 12/27/2018) (anc) (Entered: 01/02/2019) |
| 12/27/2018 | | Case Stayed. (anc) (Entered: 01/14/2019) |
| 02/01/2019 | <u>83</u> | NOTICE OF CHANGE OF ADDRESS by Caroline Decell on behalf of Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. New Address: Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University, 475 Riverside Drive, Suite 302, New York, New York, United States of America 10115, (646) 745-8500. (Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 02/01/2019) |
| 02/06/2019 | <u>84</u> | MOTION for Aditya Vijay Kamdar to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-16304455. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Affidavit, # <u>2</u> Certificate of Good Standing, # <u>3</u> Text of Proposed Order)(Kamdar, Aditya) (Entered: 02/06/2019) |
| 02/06/2019 | | >>>NOTICE REGARDING PRO HAC VICE MOTION. Regarding Document No. <u>84</u> MOTION for Aditya Vijay Kamdar to Appear Pro Hac Vice . Filing fee \$ 200.00, receipt number ANYSDC-16304455. Motion and supporting papers to be reviewed by Clerk's Office staff.. The document has been reviewed and there are no deficiencies. (bcu) (Entered: 02/06/2019) |
| 02/07/2019 | <u>85</u> | ORDER FOR ADMISSION TO PRACTICE PRO HAC VICE granting <u>84</u> Motion for Adi Kamdar to Appear Pro Hac Vice. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 2/7/2019) (ks) (Entered: 02/07/2019) |
| 02/13/2019 | <u>86</u> | LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time of <i>Proposed Briefing Schedule, on Consent</i> addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated February 13, 2019. Document filed by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Customs and Border Protection, U.S. Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Department of |

| | | |
|------------|------------|---|
| | | Justice, U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 02/13/2019) |
| 02/15/2019 | <u>87</u> | ORDER granting <u>86</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 2/15/2019) (mro) (Entered: 02/15/2019) |
| 02/15/2019 | | Set/Reset Deadlines: Cross Motions due by 4/15/2019. Motions due by 3/15/2019. Responses due by 5/15/2019 Replies due by 5/29/2019. (mro) (Entered: 02/15/2019) |
| 02/26/2019 | <u>88</u> | LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages <i>On Consent, and a Status Update Regarding DHS</i> addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated February 26, 2019. Document filed by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Customs and Border Protection, U.S. Department of Homeland Security, U.S. Department of Justice, U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 02/26/2019) |
| 02/26/2019 | <u>89</u> | MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to OLC, ICE and the State Department.</i> Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice, U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 02/26/2019) |
| 02/26/2019 | <u>90</u> | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>89</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to OLC, ICE and the State Department.</i> Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice, U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 02/26/2019) |
| 02/26/2019 | <u>91</u> | DECLARATION of Toni Fuentes in Support re: <u>89</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to OLC, ICE and the State Department..</i> Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit, # <u>2</u> Exhibit)(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 02/26/2019) |
| 02/26/2019 | <u>92</u> | DECLARATION of Paul P. Colborn in Support re: <u>89</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to OLC, ICE and the State Department..</i> Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C, # <u>4</u> Exhibit D, # <u>5</u> Exhibit E)(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 02/26/2019) |
| 02/26/2019 | <u>93</u> | DECLARATION of Eric F. Stein in Support re: <u>89</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to OLC, ICE and the State Department..</i> Document filed by U.S. Department of State. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit 1 – Vaughn Index, # <u>2</u> Exhibit 2, # <u>3</u> Exhibit 3, # <u>4</u> Exhibit 4, # <u>5</u> Exhibit 5, # <u>6</u> Exhibit 6, # <u>7</u> Exhibit 7)(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 02/26/2019) |
| 02/27/2019 | <u>94</u> | ORDER granting <u>88</u> Letter Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 2/27/2019) (ne) (Entered: 02/27/2019) |
| 03/15/2019 | <u>95</u> | MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to USCIS and ICE.</i> Document filed by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 03/15/2019) |
| 03/15/2019 | <u>96</u> | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to USCIS and ICE.</i> Document filed by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 03/15/2019) |
| 03/15/2019 | <u>97</u> | DECLARATION of Jill A. Eggleston in Support re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to USCIS and ICE..</i> Document filed by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 03/15/2019) |
| 03/15/2019 | <u>98</u> | DECLARATION of Toni Fuentes in Support re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to USCIS and ICE..</i> Document filed by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit Vaughn Index)(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 03/15/2019) |
| 03/28/2019 | <u>99</u> | LETTER MOTION for Leave to File Excess Pages <i>on Consent</i> addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from Carrie DeCell dated March 28, 2019. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 03/28/2019) |
| 03/28/2019 | <u>100</u> | MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to ICE, OLC, and DOS.</i> Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 03/28/2019) |

| | | |
|------------|----------------------------|--|
| 03/28/2019 | <u>101</u> | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>100</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to ICE, OLC, and DOS.</i> . Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 03/28/2019) |
| 03/28/2019 | <u>102</u> | DECLARATION of Carrie DeCell in Support re: <u>100</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to ICE, OLC, and DOS..</i> Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B)(Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 03/28/2019) |
| 04/01/2019 | <u>103</u> | ORDER granting <u>99</u> Letter Motion for Leave to File Excess Pages. SO ORDERED. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 4/1/2019) (mro) (Entered: 04/01/2019) |
| 04/15/2019 | <u>104</u> | MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to ICE and USCIS.</i> Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 04/15/2019) |
| 04/15/2019 | <u>105</u> | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>104</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to ICE and USCIS. .</i> Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 04/15/2019) |
| 04/15/2019 | <u>106</u> | DECLARATION of Carrie DeCell in Support re: <u>104</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to ICE and USCIS..</i> Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B, # <u>3</u> Exhibit C)(Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 04/15/2019) |
| 04/16/2019 | <u>107</u> | NOTICE of Errata and Corrections re: <u>105</u> Memorandum of Law in Support of Motion, <u>106</u> Declaration in Support of Motion., Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 04/16/2019) |
| 04/16/2019 | <u>108</u> | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>104</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to ICE and USCIS. CORRECTION OF ECF No. 105 .</i> Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 04/16/2019) |
| 04/16/2019 | <u>109</u> | DECLARATION of Carrie DeCell in Support re: <u>104</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to ICE and USCIS..</i> Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Attachments: # <u>1</u> Exhibit A, # <u>2</u> Exhibit B [CORRECTED], # <u>3</u> Exhibit C)(Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 04/16/2019) |
| 04/22/2019 | <u>110</u> | LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated April 22, 2019. Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice, U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 04/22/2019) |
| 05/03/2019 | <u>111</u> | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to USCIS and ICE. and In Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion.</i> Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice, U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/03/2019) |
| 05/03/2019 | <u>112</u> | DECLARATION of Eric Stein in Support re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to USCIS and ICE..</i> Document filed by U.S. Department of State. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/03/2019) |
| 05/03/2019 | <u>113</u> | DECLARATION of Toni Fuentes in Support re: <u>89</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to OLC, ICE and the State Department..</i> Document filed by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/03/2019) |
| 05/03/2019 | <u>114</u> | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>89</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to OLC, ICE and the State Department. CORRECTED.</i> Document filed by U.S. Department of Justice, U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/03/2019) |
| 05/13/2019 | <u>115</u> | LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply <i>by Two Days, On Consent</i> addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated May 13, 2019. Document filed by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/13/2019) |

| | | |
|------------|------------|--|
| 05/13/2019 | <u>116</u> | ORDER granting <u>110</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply re <u>110</u> LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated April 22, 2019., <u>115</u> LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply by Two Days, On Consent addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated May 13, 2019. ; granting <u>115</u> Letter Motion for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply re <u>110</u> LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated April 22, 2019., <u>115</u> LETTER MOTION for Extension of Time to File Response/Reply by Two Days, On Consent addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated May 13, 2019. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. Responses due by 5/17/2019 Replies due by 5/31/2019. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 5/13/2019) (rj) (Entered: 05/13/2019) |
| 05/17/2019 | <u>117</u> | REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>100</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to ICE, OLC, and DOS.</i> Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 05/17/2019) |
| 05/17/2019 | <u>118</u> | REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to USCIS and ICE. And In Opposition to Plaintiff's Cross-Motion.</i> Document filed by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/17/2019) |
| 05/17/2019 | <u>119</u> | DECLARATION of Jill Eggleston in Support re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to USCIS and ICE..</i> Document filed by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/17/2019) |
| 05/17/2019 | <u>120</u> | DECLARATION of Elliot Viker in Support re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to USCIS and ICE..</i> Document filed by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/17/2019) |
| 05/17/2019 | <u>121</u> | DECLARATION of Toni Fuentes in Support re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to USCIS and ICE..</i> Document filed by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 05/17/2019) |
| 05/31/2019 | <u>122</u> | REPLY MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>104</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to ICE and USCIS..</i> Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 05/31/2019) |
| 06/28/2019 | <u>123</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from the Knight First Amendment Institute dated 06/28/2019 re: Request for Oral Argument. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Graham, Megan) (Entered: 06/28/2019) |
| 07/01/2019 | <u>124</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated July 1, 2019 re: DHS Status Update. Document filed by U.S. Department of Homeland Security.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 07/01/2019) |
| 07/02/2019 | <u>125</u> | ORDER: The Court is in receipt of Plaintiff's letter dated June 28, 2019 (ECF No. 123) and Defendants' letter in response dated July 1, 2019. ECF No. 124. The Court will hold a status conference in this matter on July 9, 2019 at 3:00 p.m. The parties (and/or counsel) should appear in person in Courtroom 1306 at the Thurgood Marshall United States Courthouse, 40 Foley Square, New York, NY, on the date and time specified above. SO ORDERED. Status Conference set for 7/9/2019 at 03:00 PM in Courtroom 1306, 40 Foley Square, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Andrew L. Carter Jr. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 7/2/2019) (rj) (Entered: 07/03/2019) |
| 07/08/2019 | <u>126</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from Knight First Amendment Institute dated 07/08/2019 re: Request to Appear Telephonically. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Graham, Megan) (Entered: 07/08/2019) |
| 07/08/2019 | <u>127</u> | ORDER: Due to a change in the Court's schedule, the status conference previously scheduled for July 9, 2019, is ADJOURNED to July 16, 2019, at 3:00 p.m. The parties should appear in person in Courtroom 1306 at the Thurgood Marshall United States Courthouse, 40 Foley Square, New York, NY, on the date and time specified above. SO ORDERED., Status Conference set for 7/16/2019 at 03:00 PM in Courtroom 1306, 40 Foley Square, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Andrew L. Carter Jr. (Signed by |

| | | |
|------------|------------|---|
| | | Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 7/8/2019) (rj) (Entered: 07/08/2019) |
| 07/16/2019 | | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr: Status Conference held on 7/16/2019. Aditya Kamdar, Caroline Decell, and Megan Graham for Petitioner(s). AUSA Jennifer Blain for Government. Andre Manuel, Summer Intern present. See Docket No. 128 for details. (Court Reporter: Sonya Ketter Moore) (tdh) (Entered: 07/26/2019) |
| 07/17/2019 | <u>128</u> | ORDER SETTING ORAL ARGUMENT: The Court hereby schedules oral argument for July 31, 2019 at 11:00 a.m. The parties should appear in person at the Thurgood Marshall United States Courthouse, 40 Foley Square, in Courtroom 1306 on the date and time specified above. Furthermore, as discussed in the July 16, 2019 proceeding, the parties are directed to submit joint status reports on or before July 19, 2019 and August 2, 2019 respectively. (Oral Argument set for 7/31/2019 at 11:00 AM in Courtroom 1306, 40 Centre Street, New York, NY 10007 before Judge Andrew L. Carter Jr.) (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 7/17/2019) (ne) (Entered: 07/17/2019) |
| 07/19/2019 | <u>129</u> | STATUS REPORT. <i>Third Joint Status Report</i> Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Graham, Megan) (Entered: 07/19/2019) |
| 07/22/2019 | <u>130</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from the Knight First Amendment Institute dated 07/22/2019 re: DHS's new search. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 07/22/2019) |
| 07/31/2019 | | Minute Entry for proceedings held before Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr: Oral Argument held on 7/31/2019. Caroline Decell, Megan Graham, and Aditya Kamdar for Plaintiff(s). AUSA Jennifer Blain for the Defendant(s). Defendant(s) Supplemental Affidavit Due: 8/7/19. Plaintiff(s) Response Due: 8/14/19. (Court Reporter: Lisa Smith) (tdh) (Entered: 08/01/2019) |
| 08/02/2019 | <u>131</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated August 2, 2019 re: Status Update re DHS's Search. Document filed by U.S. Department of Homeland Security.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/02/2019) |
| 08/07/2019 | <u>132</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated August 7, 2019 re: ICE Searches of the Office of the Director and ERO. Document filed by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/07/2019) |
| 08/07/2019 | <u>133</u> | DECLARATION of Alexander Choe in Support re: <u>89</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to OLC, ICE and the State Department..</i> Document filed by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/07/2019) |
| 08/07/2019 | <u>134</u> | DECLARATION of Eliman Jussara Solorzano in Support re: <u>89</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to OLC, ICE and the State Department..</i> Document filed by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/07/2019) |
| 08/09/2019 | <u>135</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated August 9, 2019 re: DHS Status Update. Document filed by U.S. Department of Homeland Security.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/09/2019) |
| 08/14/2019 | <u>136</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from Knight First Amendment Institute dated 08/14/2019 re: ICE Searches of the Office of the Director and ERO. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 08/14/2019) |
| 08/21/2019 | <u>137</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated August 21, 2019 re: DHS Search Status Update. Document filed by U.S. Department of Homeland Security.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 08/21/2019) |
| 08/28/2019 | <u>138</u> | MOTION for Adi Kamdar to Withdraw as Attorney <i>FOR PLAINTIFF</i> . Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Kamdar, Aditya) (Entered: 08/28/2019) |
| 08/29/2019 | <u>139</u> | MEMO ENDORSED ORDER granting <u>138</u> Motion to Withdraw as Attorney. ENDORSEMENT: SO ORDERED. Attorney Aditya Kamdar terminated. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 8/29/2019) (rj) (Entered: 08/29/2019) |

| | | |
|------------|----------------------------|---|
| 09/13/2019 | | ***DELETED DOCUMENT. Deleted document number <u>140</u> Opinion and Order. The document was incorrectly filed in this case. (js) (Entered: 09/16/2019) |
| 09/13/2019 | <u>140</u> | OPINION AND ORDER re: <u>100</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to ICE, OLC, and DOS</i> filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. For the foregoing reasons, Defendants' partial motion for summary judgment is GRANTED in part and DENIED in part. Plaintiff's Cross Partial Motion for Summary Judgment is GRANTED in part and DENIED in part. The Clerk of Court is respectfully directed to terminate the Motion at docket entry 100. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 9/13/2019) (ne) (Entered: 09/16/2019) |
| 09/23/2019 | <u>141</u> | OPINION AND ORDER re: <u>95</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to USCIS and ICE</i> filed by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement, U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, <u>89</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to OLC, ICE and the State Department</i> filed by U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement, U.S. Department of Justice, <u>104</u> MOTION for Summary Judgment <i>as to ICE and USCIS</i> filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. For the foregoing reasons, Defendants' Motions for Summary Judgment are GRANTED in part and DENIED in part, and Plaintiff's Cross-Motion for Summary Judgment is GRANTED in part and DENIED in part as follows: (1) ICE's Motion is granted and Plaintiff's Cross-Motion is denied with respect to its application of Exemption 5 to the First Amendment Concerns Memo, the 235(c) Memo, the EO Implementation Memo. (2) Plaintiff's Cross-Motion is granted and ICE's Motion is denied with respect to the Extreme Vetting Memo, the Foreign Policy Provisions Memo, and the HSI Updates Memo. ICE must re-assess its applied exemptions to these records, using this Opinion as guidance, and disclose all responsive non-exempt materials that can reasonably be segregated from exempt materials. (3) USCIS' Motion is granted and Plaintiff's Cross-Motion denied with respect to the TRIG Options Paper and TRIG Exemptions. (4) Plaintiff's Cross-Motion is granted and USCIS' motion is denied with respect to the Acting Director Memo and Senior Policy Council Paper. USCIS must release the reasonably segregable information in these records. (5) The government's motions for summary judgment regarding the unchallenged documents are granted. (Signed by Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr on 9/23/2019) (ne) (Entered: 09/23/2019) |
| 09/24/2019 | <u>142</u> | NOTICE OF APPEARANCE by Leena M. Charlton on behalf of Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Charlton, Leena) (Entered: 09/24/2019) |
| 09/30/2019 | <u>143</u> | MOTION for Reconsideration <i>in Part of the Court's September 16 and 23 Orders.</i> Document filed by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 09/30/2019) |
| 09/30/2019 | <u>144</u> | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Support re: <u>143</u> MOTION for Reconsideration <i>in Part of the Court's September 16 and 23 Orders.</i> . Document filed by U.S. Citizenship and Immigration Services, U.S. Department of State, U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement. (Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 09/30/2019) |
| 10/04/2019 | <u>145</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from AUSA Ellen Blain dated October 4, 2019 re: ICE Status Update. Document filed by U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement.(Blain, Jennifer) (Entered: 10/04/2019) |
| 10/11/2019 | <u>146</u> | LETTER addressed to Judge Andrew L. Carter, Jr. from Knight First Amendment Institute dated 10/11/2019 re: ICE, DHS, and Item 1 Searches. Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University.(Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 10/11/2019) |
| 10/15/2019 | <u>147</u> | MEMORANDUM OF LAW in Opposition re: <u>143</u> MOTION for Reconsideration <i>in Part of the Court's September 16 and 23 Orders.</i> . Document filed by Knight First Amendment Institute at Columbia University. (Decell, Caroline) (Entered: 10/15/2019) |